

Annexure III

ToR 3: Selection of 'Project Management Unit (PMU) for Implementation of Programme to Accelerate Development for MSME Advancement (PADMA) in the state of Haryana'

S. No.	Clause in RFP	Content in RFP	Queries/ Comments	Response from the Directorate
1.	Clause no. 6.1 – Bid submission	b) The bidder shall submit the proposal via email on clusterharyana@gmail.com, cd-cell.msme@hry.gov.in within the prescribed period of 21 days after the date of issue of ToR	We kindly request the directorate to clarify if the proposal needs to be submitted in online mode through email or if it should also be accompanied with physical submission of the proposal in sealed cover as mentioned in the Clause no. 6.5 of the ToR.	Refer to the Corrigendum No.1 dated 13.10.2022 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The consultancy company/agency shall submit their technical proposals in the prescribed format, as per the requirements of the respective ToRs, via separate emails on clusterharyana@gmail.com, cd-cell.msme@hry.gov.in by 20.11.2022. The financial proposal for ToR 1 and 3 shall be submitted to the Directorate, in a sealed envelope, at the below-mentioned address latest by 20.11.2022: The Director General, Directorate of MSME, Plot No. C-3, HSVP Complex (Front Block), 3rd floor, Sector 6, Panchkula – 134109
2.	General Queries	Regarding Pre-bid meeting	We humbly request the department to clarify if a pre-bid meeting will be held which will be beneficial to address queries of all the eligible bidders and prepare quality proposals for the bid.	No pre-bid meeting shall be held.
3.	General Queries	Regarding EMD and Bid-processing Fee	We understand that only technical proposal and financial quote need to be submitted in response to the ToR. We kindly request the department to confirm that there is no Earnest Money Deposit (EMD) and Bid processing fee to be submitted.	Refer to the HARTRON empanelment guidelines.
4.	Clause 4.2 – Resource Marks	Point no. 10 – Presentation <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Understanding of the assignment Approach & methodology (20 marks)	We understand that a presentation highlighting bidder's understanding of the assignment along with the Approach and Methodology need to be delivered. We kindly request the directorate to provide information on tentative date, mode of presentation (Video Conferencing/Offline), and duration of presentation in order to prepare quality presentation for the assignment.	The date and time of the presentation shall be communicated in due course of time, subsequent to the submission of proposal. The presentation and interview of the proposed resources shall be held in-person in Chandigarh/Panchkula. The duration of the presentation should be restricted to 20 minutes. Presentation shall be delivered only by the proposed team members, post which 30 minutes team interaction/ interview will be undertaken.

S. No.	Clause in RFP	Content in RFP	Queries/ Comments	Response from the Directorate
5.	Clause 6.1 – Bid Submission	d. Technical score (maximum 100) will be calculated as per table under Clause 4.2 pertaining to resume and interview score of candidates.	We request the department to kindly clarify the mode of interview for the proposed resources. As many large firms have different mandates and high value projects, teams are available as per need basis of the project. Hence, we request the directorate to kindly conduct the interviews in online mode for technical evaluation.	Resources proposed as part of the technical proposal shall be interviewed in-person in Chandigarh/Panchkula.
6.	General Queries	Regarding Services of Strategy Experts from bidders	We understand that 9 consultants are needed for the given assignment on full-time basis. We kindly request the department to clarify if strategy support of experts from the bidders organization will be required on need-basis for the assignment, which will already be included in the financial quote.	Already clarified in the ToR. Refer to Clause 6.6 (k).
7.	General Queries	Regarding clarifications on service agreement	We understand that a separate ToR is issued regarding this assignment. However, with the unavailability of sample service agreement format in the given ToR, we kindly request the directorate to clarify the following legal points in order to completely comprehend the nature of engagement. a) Indemnification b) Retention of confidential information and compelled disclosure c) Non Solicitation and Non Exclusivity d) Limitation of liability in terms of contract value e) Termination right of the bidder f)	Refer to the HARTRON empanelment guidelines.
8.	General Queries	Regarding Power of Attorney	We humbly as the department to suggest if a Power of Attorney document needs to be included in the proposal from the bidders.	A Power of Attorney/Board resolution must be included in the proposal for Authorized signatory.
9.	Bidder Experience	--NA-- (Additional/New Clause request)	Large scale programme management in the areas of MSME development and cluster approach would require specific expertise and previous experience for	No change.

S. No.	Clause in RFP	Content in RFP	Queries/ Comments	Response from the Directorate
			<p>successful delivery. Prior professional experience of the firms across these areas will help the Directorate to derive maximum benefit out of the engagement.</p> <p>Further, as we understand that technical requirements of HARTRON empanelment were not specific nature and also, as per clause 6.3 of Request for Empanelment of Companies/Agencies for Providing Consultancy Services to Departments/ Boards/ Corporations of Haryana State "HARTRON shall invite technical proposals from its empanelled Companies/Agencies, as per the requirements of the concerned Department, for providing consultancy services, on the basis of scope of work which will be circulated by the department along with clearly defined selection criteria, milestones, payment terms & conditions, SLAs etc."</p> <p>Also, clause 3.7 of Manual for Procurement of Consultancy & Other Services issued by Department of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance, Government of India: "selection of consultants is Therefore, normally done in a two stage process. In the first stage likely capable sources are shortlisted, if need be through an 'Expression of Interest' (Eoi) through advertisement. On the basis of responses received, consultants meeting the relevant qualification and experience requirements for the given assignment are shortlisted for further consideration.</p> <p>The shortlist should include a sufficient number, not fewer than three (3) and not more than eight (8) eligible firms. In the second stage, the shortlisted consultants are invited to submit their technical and financial (RfP) proposals generally in</p>	

S. No.	Clause in RFP	Content in RFP	Queries/ Comments	Response from the Directorate
			<p>separate sealed envelopes. Evaluation of the technical proposal is carried out by evaluators without access to the financial part of the proposal. Financial proposals are opened after evaluation of quality.”</p> <p>Therefore, we request you to include eligibility conditions including past experience of firm in the existing ToRs.</p> <p>Also, is worth to mention that DITECH has considered firm experience as a qualifying criterion in the ToRs released under the current empanelment of Hartron.</p>	
10.	Section 4, key resource requirement	General	<p>Existing evaluation criteria of the resource profiles seems quite subjective.</p> <p>In order to increase the objectivity and bring transparency in evaluation, kindly mention minimum qualifying criteria and add slabs for grading of marks pertaining to experience in the project.</p>	No change.
11.	Section 4, key resource requirement	General	<p>As per ToRs, only “Post Qualification” experience shall only be considered as “Total experience”. Most of the leading colleges across India and world prefer experienced candidates for enrolment in MBA/PGDM course.</p> <p>Accordingly, good candidates from leading business colleges would have relevant Pre-qualification experience.</p> <p>Hence, it is suggested that relevant experience after “Graduation” may also be considered for evaluating “Total experience”</p>	No change.
12.	Section 4, key resource requirement ('Project Management Unit (PMU) for	Consultant 1&2: Full time regular graduation (B.E./B.Tech/ B.Com/BBA/B.Sc) Or MBA/PGDM/PGDBM/ Masters or Equivalent (in	While in most of the other profiles under the RFPs, BA and Masters in Economics is mentioned as eligible qualification, it is missing in the case of ' Consultants'. Degree in Economics is very relevant for the kind of	<p>The clause shall be changed to:</p> <p>Full time regular graduation (B.E./B.Tech/B.Com/BBA/B.Sc/BA) Or MBA/PGDM/PGDBM/Masters or Equivalent (in Business Management/Public Policy/Engineering/Finance/Marketing/Economics, etc.)from reputed national or international institutes, with at least 60% aggregate marks or equivalent CGPA</p>

S. No.	Clause in RFP	Content in RFP	Queries/ Comments	Response from the Directorate
	Strengthening of MSME ecosystem in Haryana leveraging robust policy framework & enhanced institutional support')	Business Management/Public Policy/Engineering/ Finance/Marketing, etc.) from reputed national or international institutes, with at least 60% aggregate marks or equivalent CGPA	work expected from the Consultants, hence the same may be allowed	
13.		If at any point in time, the Government of Haryana feels that a resource is not up to the mark, a replacement will be demanded in written and the consulting firm/ agency shall provide the replacement within two weeks as per ToR.	The existing resources in the organisation especially the senior and experienced ones would already be deployed on projects. The replacement profile will have to be sourced from the market after due diligence and commitment from the resources, however it will take 30-45 days for the resources to get free from their ongoing commitments and join the project. The joining period may be extended to 45 days	No change.
14.		The proposed resources should have PGDM/PGDBM/MBA/Masters/Post Graduate/BE/B.Tech degrees from Top NIRF Ranked Institutes/Premier/ Reputed National or International Institutes.	While the endeavour will be to select resources from NIRF ranked institutions, we believe that equal weightage and recognition should be given to experience of the resources who might not be from premier institutions. Hence the said condition could be made desirable than mandatory one	The Clause has been removed.
15.		The consulting firm/ agency shall deploy the same resources as per the proposal submitted within 15 days of issuance of work order.	The profile requirement under the RFP is specific and long term. The existing resources in the organisation especially the senior and experienced ones would already be deployed on projects. The proposed profiles would be proposed after due diligence and commitment from the resources, however it will take 30-45 days from the date of selection of the agency for the resources to get free from their ongoing commitments and join the project.	No change.

S. No.	Clause in RFP	Content in RFP	Queries/ Comments	Response from the Directorate
			The joining period may be extended to 45 days	
16.	Similar profiles under both the RFPs		The resource requirement for both the RFPs is on similar lines and overlapping. We assume that same profiles can be proposed for both the assignments. Please confirm	These are two separate projects with requirement of separate teams and separate resources.
17.	Last date for submission of proposals	21 days from issuance of ToRs	Clarifications to the above considerations are critical to submission of a good quality proposal. Owing to the festive season there is limited availability of resources. It is requested that the last date of submission for the proposal be extended to 21 days from the release of clarifications to pre-bid queries/ suggestions.	No change in the submission timeline.
18.	Pre-Qualification Criteria Not asked in the RFP	Missing Clause	<p>Modified Clause:</p> <p>Add Pre-Qualification Criteria</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Bidder must have an average annual turnover of minimum INR 100 crores during the last 3 financial years ending March 31, 2022 from India operations The bidder must have at least 200 full time consulting professionals on the company's rolls, as on October 31, 2022 <p>Reason for modification</p> <p>HARTRON adopted a generic model of empanelment considering the ability of interested firms to support either a specific service or a wide range of requirements. Thus, the pre-qual criteria used for shortlisting firms for empanelment included minimal requirements:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Average of the Turnovers from the last 3 Financial Years (2018-19, 2019-20, 2020-21) from Management Consultancy services should be at least INR 5 Crores 	No change.

S. No.	Clause in RFP	Content in RFP	Queries/ Comments	Response from the Directorate												
			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Company/Agency should have minimum 35 Full Time Resources on their own payroll as on date of submission of bid <p>However, the scope of work in the ToR is extensive with a wide range of technical requirements necessitating full time deployment of 9 resources for 24 months, amounting to a consulting fee of approx.. INR 6,00,00,000 as per HARTRON rates. The consulting fee is more than the minimum turnover requirement of the empanelled firms. Likewise, a firm with 35 Full Time Resources shall be required to deploy almost about 26% of the firm's resources for the project, thus significantly limiting the firm's capabilities to provide suitable replacement or additional resources, in case of need. Given the strategic importance of the project for the state, we strongly recommend that prequalification criteria should be introduced to ensure that the selected firm has the financial capabilities and resource strength to support the state government on this engagement for the next 2/3 years with minimal disruption.</p>													
19.	Evaluation Criteria Clause 6.3 (Page 20)	<p>Clause as per the ToR:</p> <p>6.3 Pattern of Evaluation:</p> <p>Evaluation of the qualified consultancy company/agency shall be done based on the following evaluation criteria:-</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="505 1222 997 1453"> <thead> <tr> <th>Sr. No.</th> <th>Criteria</th> <th>Maximum Marks</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td> <td>Qualification of resources (Team Leaders & Team Members)</td> <td>40</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Sr. No.	Criteria	Maximum Marks	1	Qualification of resources (Team Leaders & Team Members)	40	<p>Modified Clause:</p> <p>6.3 Pattern of Evaluation:</p> <p>Evaluation of the qualified consultancy company/agency shall be done based on the following evaluation criteria:-</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="1026 1222 1553 1430"> <thead> <tr> <th>Sr. No.</th> <th>Criteria</th> <th>Maximum Marks</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td> <td>Educational Qualification of resources (Team</td> <td>10</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Sr. No.	Criteria	Maximum Marks	1	Educational Qualification of resources (Team	10	No change.
Sr. No.	Criteria	Maximum Marks														
1	Qualification of resources (Team Leaders & Team Members)	40														
Sr. No.	Criteria	Maximum Marks														
1	Educational Qualification of resources (Team	10														

S. No.	Clause in RFP	Content in RFP	Queries/ Comments	Response from the Directorate																		
		<table border="1"> <tr> <td>2</td> <td>Interview</td> <td>40</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3</td> <td>Presentation</td> <td>20</td> </tr> </table>	2	Interview	40	3	Presentation	20	<table border="1"> <tr> <td></td> <td>Leader & Team Members)</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>2</td> <td>Experience of resources (Team Leader & Team Members)</td> <td>30</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3</td> <td>Interview</td> <td>40</td> </tr> <tr> <td>4</td> <td>Presentation</td> <td>20</td> </tr> </table> <p>HARTRON empanelment places more emphasis on the experience, rather than the education qualification. The same is evident from the fact that marks percentage has been relaxed for resources with greater experience. Further, in the ToR, there is no bifurcation of marks for educational qualification and experience of resources, only a composite score of 40 marks has been shared. Given that there is a requirement for highly skilled resources for project delivery, with specific technical experience, and also, in line with the HARTRON empanelment, it is requested that more weightage should be given to the relevant experience.</p>		Leader & Team Members)		2	Experience of resources (Team Leader & Team Members)	30	3	Interview	40	4	Presentation	20	
2	Interview	40																				
3	Presentation	20																				
	Leader & Team Members)																					
2	Experience of resources (Team Leader & Team Members)	30																				
3	Interview	40																				
4	Presentation	20																				
20.	Resource Education Clause 6.6 (c) (Page 21)	The proposed resources should have PGDM/PGDBM/MBA/Masters/Post Graduate/BE/B.Tech degrees from Top NIRF Ranked Institutes/Premier/ Reputed National or International Institutes.	<p>Please remove.</p> <p>Reason for modification NIRF Rankings are dynamic and changes annually, with new additions in terms of colleges and institutes almost every year. It is not a fair assessment for resources who completed their education more than 10 years back as the education ecosystem has significantly evolved since then along with the changing evaluation parameters.</p>	The Clause has been removed.																		
21.	Relevant Experience of	Clause as per the ToR:	Modified Clause:	No change.																		

S. No.	Clause in RFP	Content in RFP	Queries/ Comments	Response from the Directorate
	Project Formulation Expert Clause 4.1 (Page 15)	<p>Resource Category Senior Consultant # 4</p> <p>Proposed Role Project Formulation Expert</p> <p>Educational Qualification as per HARTRON empanelment BE/ B.Tech/ Post-Graduate with 60% marks And/ Or MBA</p> <p>Preferred Educational Qualification Full time regular MBA/PGDM/ PGDBM/Masters or Equivalent (in Marketing/ Finance/ Economics/Rural Management) with graduation (B.E/B. Com/ B.Tech/ BBA/ B.A) from reputed national or international institutes, with at least 60% aggregate marks or equivalent CGPA</p> <p>Relevant Experience</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Minimum experience of 6 years (post qualification) with at least 3 years in assisting State or Central Government / Bilateral or Multilateral organisation/ State/ Central PSUs in undertaking MSME cluster development and setting up new MSME clusters • Experience of undertaking cluster development throughout the lifecycle, including DSRs, DPRs and implementation in major sectors 	<p>Resource Category Senior Consultant # 4</p> <p>Proposed Role Project Formulation Expert</p> <p>Educational Qualification as per HARTRON empanelment BE/ B.Tech/ Post-Graduate with 60% marks And/ Or MBA</p> <p>Preferred Educational Qualification Full time regular MBA/PGDM/ PGDBM/Masters or Equivalent (in Marketing/ Finance/ Economics/Rural Management) with graduation (B.E/B. Com/ B.Tech/ BBA/ B.A) from reputed national or international institutes, with at least 60% aggregate marks or equivalent CGPA</p> <p>Relevant Experience</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Minimum experience of 6 years (post qualification) with at least 3 years in assisting State or Central Government / Bilateral or Multilateral organisation/ State/ Central PSUs in undertaking MSME cluster development and setting up new MSME clusters • Experience of undertaking cluster development throughout the lifecycle, including DSRs, DPRs and implementation in major sectors under PADMA- Engineering, Textile, Food 	

S. No.	Clause in RFP	Content in RFP	Queries/ Comments	Response from the Directorate
		<p>under PADMA- Engineering, Textile, Food processing, Chemicals/ Plastics, ESDM/ Electronics etc. as well as traditional sectors</p>	<p>processing, Chemicals/ Plastics, ESDM/ Electronics etc. as well as traditional sectors</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Experience of preparation of Detailed Project Report and obtaining final approval for projects under state government ODOP Scheme in last 3 years • Experience of working towards increasing productivity of MSMEs and working on ODOP projects <p>Reason for modification None of the criteria evaluates the consultant experience of working with state or centre government in field of ODOP. Since the selected consultant will be working with the state government particularly on the implementation of PADMA, the consultant should have prior experience of working with government in areas of ODOP for better understanding of processes, procedures and complexities.</p>	
22.	Preferred Education Qualification of Finance Expert Clause 4.1 (Page 14)	<p>Clause as per the ToR:</p> <p>Resource Category Senior Consultant #2</p> <p>Proposed Role MSME Financing Expert</p> <p>Educational Qualification as per HARTRON empanelment BE/ B.Tech/Post Graduate with 60% marks And/ Or MBA</p> <p>Preferred Educational Qualification Full time Chartered Accountant</p>	<p>Modified Clause:</p> <p>Resource Category Senior Consultant #2</p> <p>Proposed Role MSME Financing Expert</p> <p>Educational Qualification as per HARTRON empanelment BE/ B.Tech/Post Graduate with 60% marks And/ Or MBA</p> <p>Preferred Educational Qualification Full time Chartered Accountant or MBA/ PGDM/ PGDBM/Masters or Equivalent (in</p>	No change.

S. No.	Clause in RFP	Content in RFP	Queries/ Comments	Response from the Directorate
		<p>Relevant Experience</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Minimum experience of 6 years (post qualification) with at least 3 years in assisting MSMEs leverage funding from banks/FIs • Experience of evaluating proposals for MSME projects • Experience of preparing DPRs and financial modelling for MSME development projects • Experience of enhancing linkages of micro enterprises with FIs • Experience in facilitating small loans/micro financing 	<p>Business Management/ Finance/ Economics) with graduation (B.E/ B.Com/ B.Tech/ BBA/ B.A) from reputed national or international institutes, with at least 60% aggregate marks or equivalent CGPA</p> <p>Relevant Experience</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Minimum experience of 6 years (post qualification) with at least 3 years in assisting MSMEs leverage funding from banks/FIs • Experience of evaluating proposals for MSME projects • Experience of preparing DPRs and financial modelling for MSME development projects • Experience of enhancing linkages of micro enterprises with FIs • Experience in facilitating small loans/micro financing <p>Reason for modification</p> <p>Full time Chartered Accountant with minimum experience of 6 years (post qualification) is very restrictive. It is requested that given the nature of work kindly allow resource with MBA/ PGDM/ PGDBM/Masters or Equivalent (in Business Management/ Finance/ Economics) with relevant experience in MSME Financing to also apply for the role of MSME Financing Exert.</p>	
23.	Scope of Work Activity 1.2 (Page No. 3)	Addition in Activity 1.2 (Detailed Diagnostic Study of the blocks, product value chain and ecosystem analysis, assessment of infrastructure requirement, financial assessment and preparation of comprehensive Diagnostic	<p>Inclusion of a block action plan and export plan.</p> <p>Reason for modification</p> <p>Block level action plan is required to deep-dive into the challenges faced by the block</p>	No change.

S. No.	Clause in RFP	Content in RFP	Queries/ Comments	Response from the Directorate
		Reports including model project profiles for each of the block level clusters)	and to address these challenges. This action plan would guide in building robust networks to increase production, efficiency, technology used and internal capacity building of the block. This document will serve as a roadmap for the State to implement and with necessary check-points, it will serve in delivering the overall objectives of the scheme. Export Plan will help in building export vision and serve to solve the challenges faced while exporting of products from the district.	