

**CHIEF JUSTICE'S COURT**  
**HON'BLE THE CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD**  
**HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SANJAY KISHAN KAUL**  
**HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SANJIV KHANNA**  
**HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE B.R. GAVAI**  
**HON'BLE MR. JUSTICE SURYA KANT**

**SERIAL No. 501, COURT NO.1 SECTION PIL-W**  
**SUPREME COURT OF INDIA**  
**RECORD OF PROCEEDINGS**

**Writ Petition (Civil) No.1099/2019**

**SHAH FAESAL & ORS. Petitioner(s)**

**VERSUS**

**UNION OF INDIA & ANR. Respondent(s)**

-----  
TRANSCRIPT OF HEARING

11-July-2023  
-----

**Document Control**

<b>Document Name &amp; Date</b>	Transcript of WP (Civil) 1099 of 2019 Hearing dated 11.07.2023
<b>Status</b>	Released
<b>Version</b>	1.0
<b>Last Update</b>	11.07.2023
<b>Nature of Update</b>	Original version
<b>Release Date</b>	11.07.2023
<b>Document Owner</b>	Supreme Court of India

10:30 AM IST

1 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Good morning brother.

2

3 **JUSTICE SANJAY KISHAN KAUL:** Good morning Chief.

4

5 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** So 501, what we were proposing to do is, that we  
6 can list this batch of matters on the 2nd of August. And then 2nd of August, we will start the  
7 proceedings. So that week we get Wednesday and Thursday and then continue it on the  
8 following Tuesday. Because Monday, Friday....

9

10 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** Can I give My Lords an idea.....

11

12 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** Only a minute, Mr. Ramachandran....

13

14 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Yes.

15

16 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** My Lords, since the Lord Chief Justice and Justice Khanna were not in  
17 the earlier bench, just My Lord for the purpose of procedural things, earlier there was a  
18 direction to file.... prepare and file a convenience compilation. My Lord that is filed. But parties  
19 may like to add to it.

20

21 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** The links are available. The links are available. There is a nodal  
22 counsel on this side. The nodal counsel on their side may have to be....

23

24 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Who is the nodal counsel on your side?

25

26 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** Mr. Prasanna.

27

28 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Mr. Prasanna, and....

29

30 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** It was [UNCLEAR]

31

32 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** Mr. Kanu Agarwal will be on our side. So whatever My Lord, Your  
33 Lordships may consider fixing a date before which all parties can add to the....

34

35 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** So we can really say that they can do that at least  
36 a week before the hearing. So if parties complete everything on the 26th, which is Wednesday,

1 that will give all of you enough time. So we can actually say 25th, so that gives enough time  
2 now.

3

4 **ADVOCATE:** My Lords there also may be a need to file an additional affidavit as far as the  
5 Serial No. 8 is concerned. So that liberty may be granted. We will do it within 10 days  
6 maximum.

7

8 **ML SHARMA:** May I say....

9

10 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Brother Kaul, we will ask them, they can then  
11 prepare the convenience compilation, add to the existing compilation, the usual directions that  
12 the two nodal counsels will sit together and make sure that they prepare a common  
13 convenience compilation.

14

15 **JUSTICE SANJAY KISHAN KAUL:** I wanted to ask, you see this business of additional  
16 affidavits, additional compilations, this matter was substantively heard when three of us were  
17 there. And somehow at that time the issue got raised whether it should be decided by a five  
18 judges' bench or go to a seven judges' bench. So there was a little diversion. On the basis of  
19 that diversion that issue got flagged and that issue was taken up. I am a little if I may say so,  
20 at loss to find out what further compilation, what further additional affidavits are to be filed.  
21 There is no change. It's a challenge to a....

22

23 **ADVOCATE:** It is only the Union which has filed an affidavit.

24

25 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** Our affidavit only reflects My Lord the position post 5th August 2019, to  
26 which nobody would be required to rely.

27

28 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** In that sense, that has no bearing on the  
29 constitution.

30

31 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** That does not affect the legal challenge. We don't have to....

32

33 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** And we will not....

34

35 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** In that sense file more affidavits.

36

37 **ADVOCATE:** Then the Union's affidavit may also be disregarded.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37

**JUSTICE SANJAY KISHAN KAUL:** See Solicitor, what I apprehend is you will add... give a post scenario. Now those people will file another affidavit, because they have to give a version of their post scenario. So what happens is in the bargain, it's a pure constitutional question which is involved in the matter.

**TUSHAR MEHTA:** Correct My Lords, correct. What I am suggesting is My Lords, nobody is suggesting any further affidavit.

**CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** And you are not relying on that affidavit because in that sense...

**TUSHAR MEHTA:** That is for Your Lordship's consumption My Lord. Not that other side will be....

**CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** One more thing. I mean after we did this Constitution Bench on the marriage equality matter, until the last day we kept on getting additional submissions, fresh submissions, rejoinder submissions. Once submissions have been filed, we have to freeze it at that. Because you know otherwise what happens is right until the last evening, on the last evening we got a 1000 page compilation, which means you know, this is unfair to the members who are appearing, the members of the bar who are appearing. It is unfair to the bench because you know we have got ready on the basis of the record as it stands and when the matter is being argued. So I think everybody must now conform to the discipline of freezing everything before the argument starts.

**RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** We will make sure Your Lordships that that will not happen.

**DUSHYANT DAVE:** That affidavit should not then be taken on record.

**JUSTICE SANJAY KISHAN KAUL:** I would join the [UNCLEAR]

**DUSHYANT DAVE:** As if 370 scrapping has really benefited which My Lord then we will have to deal with it....

**CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** But really speaking, really speaking Mr. Dave, that affidavit has no bearing on the....

1 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** Yes My Lord, it can come on record.

2

3 **DUSHYANT DAVE:** It has come, it has appeared in press very widely today morning.

4

5 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** No, that can't be....

6

7 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** That is for the press. That is not for us.

8

9 **ML SHARMA:** Kindly....

10

11 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** It is served upon everyone.

12

13 **DUSHYANT DAVE:** We haven't got it, Mr. Mehta.

14

15 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** Give him 10 minutes.

16

17 **DUSHYANT DAVE:** No, I am sure you will give. I am just saying.

18

19 **DUSHYANT DAVE:** My Lord Justice Gavai's smile is telling. As I always say My Lord, bar  
20 also [UNCLEAR] judicial notice.

21

22 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** Bar sometimes My Lord tries and reads Your Lordship's silence....

23 May I suggest something My Lord? Which would My Lord meet with everyone's requirement.

24 My Lord there cannot be any reason for anyone on this side to shy away from the facts

25 mentioned post '19. I can make a statement, both of us can make a statement. That would not

26 be a justification for deciding the constitutionality involved.

27

28 **GOPAL SATYANARAYANAN:** Then it is not relevant.

29

30 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** Why, why... everyone should....

31

32 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Alright, we will say this. What we will say....

33 Alright we will say this, that, the hearing of the petitions before the Constitution Bench shall

34 commence on 2 August 2023 at 10:30 AM, and shall thereafter proceed from day to day, except

35 for the miscellaneous days, namely, Mondays and Fridays. It has been agreed that Mr.

36 Prasanna, Learned Counsel assisting on the side of the petitioners and Mr. Kanu Agarwal,

1 learned counsel appearing assisting on the side of the Respondents shall be the nodal counsel  
2 for the preparation of common convenience compilations. Since convenience compilations  
3 have already been prepared earlier, should any of the Counsel seek to add to them, this shall  
4 be done positively by 27 July 2023. The nodal counsel shall ensure that the convenience  
5 compilations are indexed and paginated to facilitate the hearing. All the learned counsel shall  
6 be given copies of the convenience compilation so indexed and paginated immediately after  
7 the compilations are prepared. The convenience compilations shall, written submissions shall  
8 also be filed on or before 27th July 2023. After 27th July 2023, no further additions to the  
9 convenience compilation shall be permissible and the arguments shall proceed on the basis of  
10 the status of the record as on 27th July 2023. The Solicitor General has informed the Court  
11 that the Union of India, that though the Union of India has filed an additional affidavit, setting  
12 out the perspective of the Union Government in regard to the post notification developments,  
13 the contents of the affidavit have no bearing on the constitutional issues which are raised in  
14 the petitions and which shall hence not be relied upon....

15

16 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** For that purpose.

17

18 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** For that purpose.

19

20 **ADVOCATE:** My Lords, small, there is....

21

22 **JUSTICE SANJAY KISHAN KAUL:** Even Chief Justice, the synopsis I think they have  
23 been filed by both the parties already.

24

25 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Just one second, Justice Kaul is trying to say  
26 something. Yes Justice Kaul?

27

28 **ML SHARMA:** My Lord shall permit me allow to speak.

29

30 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Just one second, Justice Kaul was saying  
31 something, because he is online.

32

33 **JUSTICE SANJAY KISHAN KAUL:** In view of the stage which this matter had reached,  
34 Chief Justice, the synopsis also had been filed by the parties. So unless they want to  
35 supplement it, both sides had filed, at least especially the petitioners' side had almost  
36 completed argument. So the synopsis was already filed. So they may look at whether they want  
37 to rely on you know, somewhat altering the same may not be useful.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36

**CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Justice Kaul says if you don't want to supplement from....

**GOPAL SANKARANARAYANAN:** We need to supplement. There have been subsequent judgements which have come in the last 2 years which we have to rely on.

**CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** That's right.

**TUSHAR MEHTA:** Supplement if required.

**CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** That you have already said now.

**ADVOCATE:** Democratic parties.

**RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** There are totally....

**ML SHARMA:** My Lord.

**CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Any additional material which is permitted to be filed by the date so prescribed, shall be filed only through the nodal counsel.

**ATTORNEY GENERAL VENUGOPAL:** The only concern in asking this kind of indulgence is, especially in a matter like this, the course of an argument, a perspective on how you look at a constitutional provision or even develop and take earlier or later, how they could be seen in a particular perspective will be matter for the Court and the counsel to assist the Court. Therefore to foreclose everything at this stage would be little problematic.

**CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Let there be a.... only document. Mr. Attorney General, it will become impossible because if people start filing things, I think this is now....let us now follow this as a modality for Constitution Bench hearings that at least a week before the hearing starts, everybody is aware of what they are going to argue, and then you conclude it with....

**RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** My Lords....

1 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Only one last thing which I wanted to suggest  
2 was this, apportionment of time. I think that's very important. I would suggest that on the side  
3 of the petitioners you must sit down together, decide who is going to argue what point.

4

5 **GOPAL SATYANARAYANAN:** Mr. Ramachandran is leading us.

6

7 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** The order in which arguments would be  
8 addressed should be given to us in advance by the nodal counsel. Likewise, on the side of the  
9 Respondents. And please apportion time between yourselves. We might do that before we  
10 commence the hearing.

11

12 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** On this side also we'll do.

13

14 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Do that so that you know we can....

15

16 **GOPAL SATYANARAYANAN:** We've done it before, we will do that. We have 23 petitions  
17 My Lords on this list, of which 14 of them are the challenges. The 370 challenges. Eight of them  
18 are prior in time, which are challenging Article 35(A). Those actually can evade the outcome  
19 of these 14 , because if we succeed here then those have to be heard. If we fail completely here  
20 then those become infructuous. They are on the list. I have in fact [UNCLEAR].

21

22 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** You can hand it over to the court master. And  
23 perhaps what you can do is, this can be added in the convenience compilation so that instead  
24 of taking....

25

26 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** At this stage may not perhaps My Lord....

27

28 **ADVOCATE:** We have two [UNCLEAR]

29

30 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** All convenience compilations shall be  
31 prepared.... all convenience compilations shall be exclusively in the electronic mode.

32

33 **ADVOCATE:** There is a national....

34

35 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Mr. Dwivedi, we'll do that. We'll decide that after  
36 the matter opens. We'll not do anything in regards right now.

37



1 **ADVOCATE:** Your Lordships, bookmark.... Menaka just one minute.

2

3 **DR. MENAKA GURUSWAMY:** Awami National Congress, the leaders were under arrest  
4 at the time the hearings were going on. Finally, they have been able to sign off on the writ  
5 petition If we file that we have a diary number notice [UNCLEAR].

6

7 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** No, let us see. I do not know My Lord. Nobody was under arrest for three  
8 years.

9

10 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Why don't we do this. Issue is of  
11 Constitution....Dr. Guruswamy, question of constitutional validity is common in all these  
12 matters, and most of them. Give a copy, just give a copy to the Solicitor General.

13

14 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** She may file an intervention because to say that....

15

16 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Whether we treat it as a petition or an  
17 intervention, there is a common counter. Just give a copy to the Learned Solicitor General.

18

19 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** I have no difficulty. I am only My Lord, perturbed by the fact....

20

21 **ADVOCATE:** And also an impleadment My Lord.

22

23 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** We just told you what to do. Give a copy to the....

24

25 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** I have taken.... My Lord, I will take the copy. There is no difficulty.

26

27 **JUSTICE SANJAY KISHAN KAUL:** Taking a copy is not a problem.

28

29 **ADVOCATE:** Mr. Mehta, just one minute.

30

31 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** It is an order My Lord. Kindly see....

32

33 **ADVOCATE:** Impleadment of a political party....

34

35 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Alright. Insofar as the impleadments are  
36 concerned, please take it that we are not going to shut anybody out like this.

37

1 **ADVOCATE:** Very well.

2

3 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** But everybody will have to ration time.

4

5 **ADVOCATE:** Yes.

6

7 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Because once the first two or three counsel have  
8 argued the matter, then the others know what has been covered, what ground has been  
9 covered. Therefore, time has to be apportioned otherwise matter is...

10

11 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** Absolutely My Lords, we did it In the same sex marriage case....

12

13 **ADVOCATE:** Shah Faesal....

14

15 **ADVOCATE:** My Lords, there is....only a minute, only a minute.

16

17 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** There is also....

18

19 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Alright, one thing. The two nodal counsel, Mr.  
20 Prasanna and Mr. Kanu Agarwal, insofar as the intervention applications are concerned,  
21 please ensure that the intervention applications are also given to the two nodal counsel. You  
22 can prepare in the index, a separate head for the intervention application number, who it will  
23 be in file to and the arguing counsel. So that, ideally if both of you can tabulate for us what the  
24 essence of the intervention is, that will facilitate....

25

26 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** Only one aspect....

27

28 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** There is only one small housekeeping detail My Lords. In the  
29 lead petition, in the first petition in which I'm appearing out of seven petitioners, two  
30 petitioners have moved applications to be deleted. Those may be allowed My Lords, and we'll  
31 give the amended cause title. So now five petitioners will remain out of seven. The cause title  
32 will have to change accordingly. Those who want to be deleted would like to be deleted today  
33 My Lords.

34

35 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** What is the IA number? And who are the two  
36 petitioners? Who are the two petitioners who want to be deleted?

37

1 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** One is My Lords, Dr. Shah Faesal, the first petitioner, and Ms.  
2 Shweta...

3

4 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** That is an IAS officer My Lords, working in the Ministry. Therefore, he  
5 possibly doesn't want to continue. We have no objection if there are other petitioners and  
6 others can argue.

7

8 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** Number three, Shehla Rashid. These two don't want to  
9 continue. Five others will continue.

10

11 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** *Yeh number le lijiye.* Numbers?

12

13 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** One and three.

14

15 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** One and three, *naam ley lijiye.* She will be  
16 deleted from the array of parties. The application for deletion....

17

18 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** 1099.

19

20 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** .... is not opposed. The application for deletion  
21 is hence allowed.

22

23 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** And we'll file amended cause title.

24

25 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Amended cause title shall be filed within a period  
26 of one week.

27

28 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** Grateful.

29

30 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** My Lords, it's my duty to bring to Your Lordship's notice, there is a  
31 judicial order passed by Your Lordships My Lord, in this group of matters which says the  
32 registry is directed not to entertain any other writ petitions on these issues in future.  
33 Therefore, I was saying that she may file an intervention. Ultimately, she wants to be heard.  
34 Nobody would object, Ms. Guruswamy to be heard. Because otherwise there would be many  
35 petitions coming thereafter.

36

1 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** You can treat your write petition as an  
2 intervention application.

3

4 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** I will not oppose the....

5

6 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** The thing is that, you have to be heard. We'll hear  
7 you and so that in that petition you say....

8

9 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** Otherwise many more will come. That's the....

10

11 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** .... intervention application, and shall be  
12 renumbered.

13

14 **GOPAL SATYANARAYANAN:** My Lords because this batch of cases known as with Shah  
15 Faesal's name because that's the lead petition. It's going to change now with his deletion. I had  
16 a suggestion In these large batch matters, if you can just put it In Re the issue and that can be  
17 the heading. This concerns Article 370. It can be In Re Article 370 because every time the name  
18 changes, very difficult to keep track of where.....

19

20 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** There is one petitioner who is already there to request Your Lordships  
21 to treat him as a first petitioner.

22

23 **GOPAL SATYANARAYANAN:** That maybe....

24

25 **RAJU RAMACHANDRAN:** As long as that....

26

27 **JUSTICE GAVAI:** Online, online.

28

29 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** Online fastest finger fast, that I filed it first so it should...., last time, My  
30 Lord. Justice Kaul very aptly said that you are doing that fastest finger first. You file it first....

31

32 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** We'll call this as In Re Article 370.

33

34 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** Yes.

35

1 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** With a consent of all Learned Counsel and at  
2 their request, the cause title of the proceedings for convenience of reference shall be as follows:  
3 "In Re, Article 370 of the Constitution."  
4

5 **ADVOCATE:** 501 (I), one of the petitioners passed away [UNCLEAR]. We may be permitted  
6 to file an application [UNCLEAR].  
7

8 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Somebody has passed away.  
9

10 **ADVOCATE:** One of the petitioner has passed away.  
11

12 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Alright.  
13

14 **ML SHARMA:** Your Lordship.  
15

16 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Just delete that person.  
17

18 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** [UNCLEAR] a petition of this nature.  
19

20 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** *Naam ley lijiye*. The permission to delete so and  
21 so is granted.  
22

23 **TUSHAR MEHTA:** The petition would abate. Alas come My Lord denied.  
24

25 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Petitioner number 2. Just write it down for the  
26 court master so we don't make a mistake on the name.  
27

28 **ADVOCATE:** Once you have the submission, we file the intervention application in 2019  
29 [UNCLEAR] also we given opportunity of it.  
30

31 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** We've just said there but the interveners we will  
32 ration time The two nodal counsel shall prepare a list of interveners. If there are 500  
33 interveners we can't give everybody time to argue in the intervention application. We'll see  
34 what to do.  
35

36 **ADVOCATE:** [UNCLEAR] the time, filing of the fact petitions. So we'll file later on the  
37 interventions.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37

**CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Alright, we'll see when it opens up. The intervention.... will decide at the end how much time to allocate to the intervener. We'll hear the main Counsel first, and then we'll see what to do thereafter. 2nd of August.... 27th is the day for freezing all the submissions, pleadings, etc., and submissions, and the case law compilations. No further pleadings shall be filed. And we have recorded the statement of the SG that does not have a bearing on constitutional....

**TUSHAR MEHTA:** Of course not.

**CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** So 2nd we will start.

**ML SHARMA:** Your Lordship.

**ADVOCATE:** He wants to redraw an IA.

**CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** You want to withdraw an IA? Why? What is the IA for? For intervention? So we'll give it to the court master on a slip of paper, so we'll pass an order on that? Intervention dismissed.

**ML SHARMA:** Your Lordship may allow me to... Your Lordship please allow me to speak.

**CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Yes Mr. Manohar Lal Sharma.

**ML SHARMA:** Your Lordship, this is a petition. Subject matter, what I said first, notify issue by the three judges' bench, thereafter it was referred to the five judges' bench, and notice was issued also by the five judges' bench. Pleading was directed to be completed. Thereafter, one judgment also done for some intervention application. Now Your Lordship, my name has been removed. Some other name is there. I think this is not fair.

**CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Mr. Manohar Lal Sharma, this is already an issue where you are appearing. But now, to obviate all this, you have decided to call the proceedings, as In Re, Article 370 of the Constitution', so that nobody feels that he should have been or she should have been the first petitioner. We will... there is an article here....

**ML SHARMA:** Notice was issued in my petition very first thing.

1 **JUSTICE SANJAY KISHAN KAUL:** Mr. Sharma, Mr. Sharma, last time itself I told you,  
2 you will not do it like this. So please don't repeat what we had rejected last time. I recollect  
3 definitely.

4

5 **ML SHARMA:** Your Lordship.

6

7 **CHIEF JUSTICE DY CHANDRACHUD:** Brother Kaul, thank you very much for joining  
8 in with us online. Take care of your health

9

10

11

12

***END OF DAY'S PROCEEDINGS***