St. Joseph International School, Mother Virgin Garden, R.S. No. 570, South Venganallur Village, Tirunelveli Road, Rajapalayam Taluk, Virudhunagar Dist., Tamil Nadu – 630 312.

V/s.

Principal Secretary, School Education Department, Government of Tamil Nadu.

CASE NO. 199 OF 2023

Date: 05.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

Pleadings are complete. Learned counsel for the petitioner is heard. Reserved for orders.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

Immaculate English Higher Secondary School, St. Francis Xavier Church Street, T.R. Pattinam P.O., Karaikal Dist., Puducherry – 609 606.

V/s.

Secretary (Education), Chief Secretariat, No. 1, Goubert Avenue, Beach Road, Puducherry – 605 001.

CASE NO. 348 OF 2023

Date: 05.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. Ms. Tharani, Proxy Counsel for the respondent.

Though this case is registered for final arguments but Ms. Tharani, Proxy Counsel for the respondent appeared and seeks adjournment on the ground that Mr. Aravindh Selveraj, main counsel for the respondent is not well. Adjournment is granted. She is directed to file vakalatnama on behalf of respondent.

List the case for further arguments on 06.03.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

Christ College, Cuttack, Odisha – 753 008.

V/s.

- 1. The Director, Higher Education, Department of Higher Education, Government of Odisha, H.O.D. Building, Campus – II, Bhubaneswar – 751 001.
- Commissioner cum Secretary, Department of Higher Education, Government of Odisha, Secretariat Building, Campus – I, Bhubaneswar – 751 001.

MISC. CASE NO. 10 OF 2023 Date: 05.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. Mr. Amit Dubey, Proxy Counsel for the respondent.

Learned proxy counsel for the respondent seeks time to comply with the order dated 07.08.2024. He is directed to file Memorandum in terms of orders dated 07.08.2024 within two weeks and also furnish advance copy to learned counsel for the petitioner.

List the case for further arguments on 25.03.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

St. Mary's Middle School, Agiamore, Agiamore P.O., Poreyahat, Godda District, Jharkhand.

V/s.

Director, Primary Education, Department of School Education & Literacy (S.E. & L Dept.), Government of Jharkhand, MDI Building, Post Dhurwa, Dist. Ranchi, Jharkhand – 834 004.

CASE NO. 35 OF 2024

Date: 05.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

Despite sending reminder letter by post and also by email to members of the physical inspection committee, no original physical inspection report received from them till now.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has stated that members of the physical inspection committee have already inspected petitioner institution.

Office is directed that if the above-said inspection report is not received, then again send reminder letter by post and also by e-mail to the members of the physical inspection committee for sending the original physical inspection report duly signed by all the members of the physical inspection committee positively before the next date of hearing.

At request, last opportunity is granted to the petitioner to file updated recognition/ affiliation order issued by the State Competent Authority.

List the matter on 27.02.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

St. Kuriakode Middle School, Machhitarn, Pathargama P.O., Godda District, Jharkhand – 814 147.

V/s.

Director, Primary Education, Department of School Education & Literacy (S.E. & L Dept.), Government of Jharkhand, MDI Building, Post Dhurwa, Dist. Ranchi, Jharkhand – 834 004.

CASE NO. 36 OF 2024

Date: 05.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

Despite sending reminder letter by post and also by email to members of the physical inspection committee, no original physical inspection report received from them till now.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has stated that members of the physical inspection committee have already inspected petitioner institution.

Office is directed that if the above-said inspection report is not received, then again send reminder letter by post and also by e-mail to the members of the physical inspection committee for sending the original physical inspection report duly signed by all the members of the physical inspection committee positively before the next date of hearing.

At request, last opportunity is granted to the petitioner to file updated recognition/ affiliation order issued by the State Competent Authority.

List the matter on 27.02.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

St. Thomas School, Dhanbasa, Mandro P.O. Sahebganj Dist., Jharkhand – 813 208.

V/s.

Director, Primary Education, Department of School Education & Literacy (S.E. & L Dept.), Government of Jharkhand, MDI Building, Post Dhurwa, Dist. Ranchi, Jharkhand – 834 004.

CASE NO. 37 OF 2024

Date: 05.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

On 12.11.2024, copy of physical inspection report again received by post from the District Education Officer, Sahibganj, which is taken on record. On 30.07.2024, District Education Officer, Sahibganj sent the same through email.

Office is directed to send reminder letter again by post and also by e-mail to the members of the physical inspection committee for sending the original physical inspection report duly signed by all the members of the physical inspection committee positively before the next date of hearing.

At request, last opportunity is granted to the petitioner to file updated recognition/ affiliation order issued by the State Competent Authority.

List the matter on 27.02.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

St. Joseph's Middle School, Leela, Mandro P.O. Sahebganj Dist., Jharkhand – 813 208.

V/s.

Director, Primary Education, Department of School Education & Literacy (S.E. & L Dept.), Government of Jharkhand, MDI Building, Post Dhurwa, Dist. Ranchi, Jharkhand – 834 004.

CASE NO. 38 OF 2024

Date: 05.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

On 12.11.2024, copy of physical inspection report again received by post from the District Education Officer, Sahibganj, which is taken on record. On 30.07.2024, District Education Officer, Sahibganj sent the same through email.

Office is directed to send reminder letter again by post and also by e-mail to the members of the physical inspection committee for sending the original physical inspection report duly signed by all the members of the physical inspection committee positively before the next date of hearing.

At request, last opportunity is granted to the petitioner to file updated recognition/ affiliation order issued by the State Competent Authority.

List the matter on 27.02.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

St. John Mary Vianney School, Dhanbasa, Mandro PO, Sahebganj District, Jharkhand.

V/s.

Director, Primary Education, Department of School Education & Literacy (S.E. & L Dept.), Government of Jharkhand, MDI Building, Post Dhurwa, Dist. Ranchi, Jharkhand – 834 004.

CASE NO. 39 OF 2024

Date: 05.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

Despite sending reminder letter by post and also by email to members of the physical inspection committee, no original physical inspection report received from them till now.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has stated that members of the physical inspection committee have already inspected petitioner institution.

Office is directed that if the above-said inspection report is not received, then again send reminder letter by post and also by e-mail to the members of the physical inspection committee for sending the original physical inspection report duly signed by all the members of the physical inspection committee positively before the next date of hearing.

At request, last opportunity is granted to the petitioner to file updated recognition/ affiliation order issued by the State Competent Authority.

List the matter on 27.02.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

St. Savio's Middle School, Baccha, Mandro Siripur Bazar P.O., Sahebganj District, Jharkhand.

V/s.

Director, Primary Education, Department of School Education & Literacy (S.E. & L Dept.), Government of Jharkhand, MDI Building, Post Dhurwa, Dist. Ranchi, Jharkhand – 834 004.

CASE NO. 40 OF 2024

Date: 05.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

Despite sending reminder letter by post and also by email to members of the physical inspection committee, no physical inspection report received from them till now.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has stated that members of the physical inspection committee have already inspected petitioner institution.

Office is directed that if the above-said inspection report is not received, then again send reminder letter by post and also by e-mail to the members of the physical inspection committee for sending the original physical inspection report duly signed by all the members of the physical inspection committee positively before the next date of hearing.

At request, last opportunity is granted to the petitioner to file updated recognition/ affiliation order issued by the State Competent Authority.

List the matter on 27.02.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

St. Peter's School, Basaha, Bhagaiya P.O., Sahebganj Dist., Jharkhand – 813 208.

V/s.

Director, Primary Education, Department of School Education & Literacy (S.E. & L Dept.), Government of Jharkhand, MDI Building, Post Dhurwa, Dist. Ranchi, Jharkhand – 834 004.

CASE NO. 41 OF 2024

Date: 05.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

On 12.11.2024, copy of physical inspection report again received by post from the District Education Officer, Sahibganj, which is taken on record. On 30.07.2024, District Education Officer, Sahibganj sent the same through email.

Office is directed to send reminder letter again by post and also by e-mail to the members of the physical inspection committee for sending the original physical inspection report duly signed by all the members of the physical inspection committee positively before the next date of hearing.

At request, last opportunity is granted to the petitioner to file updated recognition/ affiliation order issued by the State Competent Authority.

List the matter on 27.02.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

Little Flower Middle School, Kusumba, Bahadurchowk, Mirzachowki P.O., Godda District, Jharkhand- 813 208.

Vs.

Director, Primary Education, Department of School Education & Literacy S.E & L. Department, MDI Building, Post - Dhurwa, District - Ranchi, Jharkhand- 834 004.

Case No. 43 of 2024

5.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

Despite sending reminder letter by post and e-mail to the members of the Physical Inspection Committee, we have not received any response/Physical inspection report from the members of the Physical Inspection Committee till now.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has already submitted that the members of the Physical Inspection Committee have already inspected the petitioner institution.

Office is directed to issue reminder letter again by post and e-mail to the members of the Physical Inspection Committee for sending the report positively before the next date of hearing.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has prayed for time to file updated recognition/ affiliation order issued by the competent authority. Time prayed for is allowed.

In the interest of justice, list on 27.2.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

St. Joseph's School, Pindari, Poreyahat P.O., Godda District, Jharkhand- 814 153.

Vs.

Director, Primary Education, Department of School Education & Literacy S.E & L. Department, MDI Building, Post - Dhurwa, District - Ranchi, Jharkhand- 834 004.

Case No. 44 of 2024

5.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

Despite sending reminder letter by post and e-mail to the members of the Physical Inspection Committee, we have not received any response/Physical inspection report from the members of the Physical Inspection Committee till now.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has already submitted that the members of the Physical Inspection Committee have inspected the petitioner institution.

Office is directed to issue reminder letter again by post and e-mail to the members of the Physical Inspection Committee for sending the report positively before the next date of hearing.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has prayed for time to file updated recognition/ affiliation order issued by the competent authority. Time prayed for is allowed.

In the interest of justice, list on 4.3.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

St. Joseph's School, Latona, Paraspani P.O., Godda District, Jharkhand- 814 147.

Vs.

Director, Primary Education, Department of School Education & Literacy S.E & L. Department, MDI Building, Post - Dhurwa, District - Ranchi, Jharkhand- 834 004.

Case No. 45 of 2024

5.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

Despite sending reminder letter by post and e-mail to the members of the Physical Inspection Committee, we have not received any response/Physical inspection report from the members of the Physical Inspection Committee till now.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has already submitted that the members of the Physical Inspection Committee have inspected the petitioner institution.

Office is directed to issue reminder letter again by post and e-mail to the members of the Physical Inspection Committee for sending the report positively before the next date of hearing.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has prayed for time to file updated recognition/ affiliation order issued by the competent authority. Time prayed for is allowed.

In the interest of justice, list on 4.3.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

Jeevan Jyoti School, Susni, Susni P.O., Godda District, Jharkhand-814 102.

Vs.

Director, Primary Education, Department of School Education & Literacy S.E & L. Department, MDI Building, Post - Dhurwa, District - Ranchi, Jharkhand- 834 004.

Case No. 46 of 2024

5.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

Despite sending reminder letter by post and e-mail to the members of the Physical Inspection Committee, we have not received any response/Physical inspection report from the members of the Physical Inspection Committee till now.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has already submitted that the members of the Physical Inspection Committee have inspected the petitioner institution.

Office is directed to issue reminder letter again by post and e-mail to the members of the Physical Inspection Committee for sending the report positively before the next date of hearing.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has prayed for time to file updated recognition/ affiliation order issued by the competent authority. Time prayed for is allowed.

In the interest of justice, list on 4.3.2024.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

Prabhat Tara School, Chandanahat, Chandanahat P.O., Godda District, Jharkhand- 814 157.

Vs.

Director, Primary Education, Department of School Education & Literacy S.E & L. Department, MDI Building, Post - Dhurwa, District - Ranchi, Jharkhand- 834 004.

Case No. 47 of 2024

5.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

Despite sending reminder letter by post and e-mail to the members of the Physical Inspection Committee, we have not received any response/Physical inspection report from the members of the Physical Inspection Committee till now.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has already submitted that the members of the Physical Inspection Committee have inspected the petitioner institution.

Office is directed to issue reminder letter again by post and e-mail to the members of the Physical Inspection Committee for sending the report positively before the next date of hearing.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has prayed for time to file updated recognition/ affiliation order issued by the competent authority. Time prayed for is allowed.

In the interest of justice, list on 4.3.2024.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

Kachhwa Christian School, Kachhwa Bazar, Mirzapur District, Uttar Pradesh- 231 501.

Vs.

Additional Chief Secretary, Secondary Education Department, Government of Uttar Pradesh, Bapu Bhawan, 7th Floor, Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh- 226 001.

Case No. 136 of 2024

5.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

In compliance of Commission's earlier order dated 26.9.2024, learned counsel for the petitioner has filed clarification affidavit before the Commission's office on 6.11.2024, which is taken on record.

List the case for further arguments on 6.3.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

St. Mary's EM High School, D. No. 3- 52, Vijayarai, Pedavegi Mandal, Eluru District, Andhra Pradesh- 534 475. Vs.

Secretary, Department of Minorities Welfare, Government of Andhra Pradesh, 3rd Floor, A.P. Secretariat, Velagapudi, Amravati, Andhra Pradesh- 522 503.

Case No. 137 of 2024

5.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Advocate for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

An internal communication dated 25.10.2024 (along with copy of letter dated 25.10.2024, 18.6.2024 and 27.6.2024) addressed to Commissioner of Schools, Guntur District by Secretary, Minorities Welfare (SDM) Department, Andhra Pradesh has been received by post on 4.11.2024, which is taken on record.

District Minorities Welfare Officer, Eluru District vide letter dated 5.11.2024 has sent physical inspection report which was received before the Commission's office on 19.11.2024. The same is taken on record.

Learned counsel for the petitioner has submitted that certified copies of all the relevant documents are already on record.

List the case for final arguments on 11.3.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

Don Bosco School, Amguri, P.O. Haltugaon, District Kokrajhar, (BTR), Assam- 783 370.

Vs.

Joint Secretary, Education Department (Higher), Assam Secretariat, Block C, Secretariat Complex, Dispur, Guwahati, Assam- 781 006.

Case No. 138 of 2024

5.12.2024

Present: Mr. Jose Abraham, Proxy counsel for the petitioner. None for the respondent.

District Commissioner, Kokrajhar vide letter dated 19.11.2024 has sent physical inspection report, which was received by post before the Commission's office on 26.11.2024. The same is taken on record.

In the interest of justice, list on 4.3.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

Amit Kumar, Advocate, Supreme Court of India, New Delhi.

Vs.

Principal, Jesus and Mary College, University of Delhi, San Martin Marg, Bapu Dham, New Delhi- 110 021.

Case No. Misc. 09 of 2024

5.12.2024

Present: None for the complainant. Mr. Akshat Singh, Advocate for the respondent.

Mr. Akshat Singh appeared on behalf of Mr. Sachin Singh Dalal, Advocate for respondent. He wants to file reply before the Court of the Commission. He is directed to file the same before the Commission's office today itself.

After compliance, office is directed to send copy of the reply to the complainant for filing counter, if any.

In the interest of justice, list on 25.3.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

5.12.2024

Swami Vivekananda Public School, Bye Pass Road Rajgarh Biaora, Madhya Pradesh- 465 661.

Vs.

Commissioner, Backward Classes and Minority Welfare Department, Mantralaya, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh.

Present: Mr. Harish Malik, Advocate for the appellant.

An appeal under Section 12 (B) of the NCMEI Act, 2004 has been filed on 22.11.2024 by the appellant mentioned above against the impugned order No. Kr./03/Manyata/2024-25/4106 dated 23.10.2024 issued by Deputy Director, Backward Classes and Minority Welfare, Madhya Pradesh.

2. It is mentioned the in the impugned order that the petitioner may file an appeal under Section 12(A) of the NCMEI Act, 2004. Learned counsel for the petitioner has admitted that this appeal has been filed under Section 12B of the NCMEI Act as the appellant institution has applied for minority status certificate before the State competent authority.

3. The Hon'ble Supreme Court in Civil Appeal No. 3945 of 2018 in case of Sisters of St. Joseph of Cluny vs. The State of West Bengal and Ors. vide order dated 18.04.2018, has held that any person who desires to establish a minority educational institution after the amendment Act of 2006 came into force, must apply only to the competent authority for grant of No Objection Certificate for the said purpose.

4. All applications for the establishment of a minority educational institution after the amendment Act of 2006 must go to the competent authority set up under the statute.

5. Learned counsel for the appellant is directed to file copy of the application filed before the State competent authority for grant of MSC along with proof of service.

In the interest of justice, list on 16.1.2025.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

5.12.2024

G.D. Goenka Public School, Shivpuri Link Road, Gwalior Madhya Pradesh.

Vs.

Commissioner, Backward Classes and Minority Welfare Department, Mantralaya, Bhopal, Madhya Pradesh.

Present: Mr. Manoj Jain for the petitioner.

An application has been received by post on 26.11.2024 from G.D. Goenka Public School, Shivpuri Link Road, Gwalior Madhya Pradesh for grant of minority status certificate. It be registered.

2. The petitioner has annexed a copy of the order dated 5.9.2024 issued by the Dy. Director, Deputy Director, Backward Classes and Minority Welfare, Madhya Pradesh rejecting their application for grant of minority status certificate.

3. An appeal under Section 12B of the NCMEI Act, 2004 ought to have been filed by the petitioner.

4. Mr. Manoj Jain seeks leave to withdraw the petition with liberty to file a fresh petition for the same relief. Leave and liberty is granted.

The petition is disposed of as withdrawn.

DR. SHAHID AKHTER MEMBER

5.12.2024

Saiyid Hamid Academy, E-73, Lane No. 6, Shaheen Bagh, Jamia Nagar, Okhla, New Delhi- 110 025.

Vs.

Assistant Director of Education (Act), Directorate of Education, Government of NCT of Delhi, R. No. 214-A, Old Secretariat, Delhi- 110 054.

Present: Mr. Junais P., Advocate for the petitioner.

An application has been received by hand on 25.11.2024 from Mr. Junais P., Advocate for grant of minority status certificate to Saiyid Hamid Academy, E-73, Lane No. 6, Shaheen Bagh, Jamia Nagar, Okhla, New Delhi- 110 025. It be registered.

2. It transpires from the petition that on 19.8.2024, the petitioner institution has applied for grant of No Objection Certificate to the State Competent Authority i.e. Assistant Director of Education (Act), Directorate of Education, Government of NCT of Delhi, R. No. 214-A, Old Secretariat, Delhi- 110 054, which was received by the respondent on 22.8.2024. The said petition is still pending as per the petitioner institution. The petitioner has waited sufficiently for period of 90 days as per Section 10 of NCMEI Act, 2004, before filing this petition. The petitioner has already filed the proof of delivery of track consignment to the respondent.

3. The petitioner has filed notarized copy of order dated 12.6.2024 issued by the Municipal Corporation of Delhi, New Delhi granting recognition to the petitioner institution.

4. Petitioner has filed Resolution Passed by the Governing Body to obtain Minority Status Certificate from this Commission and envelope with postage for sending notice to the State Competent Authority.

5. It also transpires from the petition that the petitioner Institute is an unaided institution (Primary).

6. During the academic year 2022-23, out of 475 students, all the students were from the Muslim minority community, in the year 2023-24, out of total 505 students, all students were from the Muslim minority community and in the year 2024-25, out of total 530 students, all the students were from the Muslim minority community.

7. It transpires from the petition that the Trust Deed of the petitioner trust was registered prior to the filing application u/s 10 of NCMEI Act. 2004 and also petition before this Commission for grant of Minority Status Certificate.

8. Clause 3.01 of the main objective of the Trust Deed only says "to establish and run schools and other such institution and institutions of higher learning" but it does not mention that the same is primarily for the benefit of the Muslim minority community and Clause 3.12 of the main objective of the Trust only speaks about promoting high standard of education and character building.

9. Heard learned counsel for the petitioner at some length.

10. List the case for further arguments on 22.1.2025.